

Преимуществом книги является то, что она издана на двух языках: русском и немецком. Текст Льва Зильбера и перевод Сабины Фаль идет параллельно. В книге представлен очень редкий визуальный материал, который будет интересен как ценителям профессиональной портретной фотографии, так и исследователям старообрядческой культуры.

Х.О. Денисюк

**LIBERALISM, TOTALITARIANISM... AND
CHRISTIANITY (RELIGION IN THE PUBLIC SPHERE:
CONTEMPORARY APPROACH)¹**

Reviewed: Enache G. **Orthodoxy, liberalism and totalitarianism in modern and contemporary Romania**. Târgoviste: Editura Cetatea de Scaun, 2016. 391 pp.

Religion in the modern world is represented as an inexhaustible item which never ceases to amaze or intrigue and meanwhile never stops to generate various social myths and contradictions.

At the same time, researchers often pass by the 'essence' of religion. Each of different approaches and prospects in the study of religion may eventually prove itself incomplete and incapable of presenting the phenomenon of religion as a whole. George Enache,² the author of *Orthodoxy, liberalism and totalitarianism in modern and contemporary Romania*, puts up the question «What is the most appropriate approach to the study of religious phenomena?» Holding this question

¹ The article was prepared with the financial support of the RFBR within the framework of the project «Religious communities in network social order structures: protest dynamics and institutional stability of the Russian region» (No. 17-33-01143).

² Enache, George Eugen – doctor of history, professor, teacher of the Faculty of History, Philosophy and Theology of the University of Galati (Galati, Romania). Reads courses on Romanian history, church history, history of culture, historiography, international relations. (profile on the Academia.edu: <https://ugal.academia.edu/GeorgeEnache>).

in mind, he reasonably takes into account the problem of religion involvement as social (and institutional) phenomenon in the complex and multifaceted process of the functioning of society. Here arise further questions like «How to explore the problem field in this context?» and «How relevant are the general conclusions reached by the predecessors in this topic?». All above-mentioned questions, as the author points out, can be asked endlessly when it comes to the subject of religion, and the whole book itself tries to give us some answers and clues.

The book deals primarily with the religious and the socio-political situation in Romania. The time frame of the presented researches is very wide and stretches from the XIX century (from the events of the revolution in the Danubian principalities in 1848) up to the modern times.

Enache proposes to focus on the «“ideological” manifestations of religion» (the author's specific term), considering (by the example of the Orthodox tradition) the influence of religion on the formation of national consciousness and the socio-political behavior of Romanians; the analysis of the place and role of the Romanian Orthodox Church in public life, including the political arena (P. 8). Moreover, the 'ideological perspective' is stated strictly as a methodological approach to research, which does not carry any ideological or propaganda attitude.

As Enache notes, such fields of research as international relations or political science (being the fruits of Western civilization which, according to the author's remarks in the Preface to the book, was mostly built up in opposition to religion) for a long time have practically ignored religion, excluding it from the sphere of public life and tolerating it only in the sphere of life and activities of individuals and local groups (P. 7). Moreover, as Enache further claims, up to almost nowadays it was characteristic to deny the transcendence, taking it only as

an element referring to religion, which implied denial of ontological reality beyond religion.

Thus, religion, as Enache writes (describing the events of the predominantly XX century and the associated position of religion in society, ideological and, in many respects, social attitudes toward the religious question), devoid of its ontological and epistemological status, was 'condemned' to inevitable disappearance; for a long period, it was believed that religion would continue to manifest only as long as there were religious individuals and institutions (churches) representing religion. From the point of view of social and political sciences, religion, thus, was presented as something that does not have any significance in the formation of society, which does not affect the power relations within states or international relations. Enache implies that social and political sciences of the previous decades has not given attention to religion as a factor driving history forward.

At the present time, as Enache shows further, there is a growing interest in the question of the place of religion in public life in Romania. This does not mean, from the scientific point of view, that 'the truths' propagated 'by religion are recognized as such'; this means that the academic world and the media (compared to previous decades) begin to notice the fact that religion is more clearly represented in public space than it has been thought up to now.

The author marks current times as an epoch of postmodernity when no main principle is clearly expressed, no dominant, normative discourse, but a sum of discourses with a certain degree of truthfulness in each of them. And religion as well can be regarded as a discourse, as a worldview or even as an ideology, one among many others.

The modern perspective, shared by political science and international relations in the matter of religion, is illustrated by

Enache with a fragment from the work «Bringing Religion into International Relations»¹ – where religion, on the one hand, is labeled as an extremely difficult subject to determine; on the other hand, the significant influence of religion on human behavior is recognized. The last claim results in the importance for modern researchers of discovering the mechanisms of such influence (among which four main aspects are highlighted: the influence of religion on the worldview and, as a consequence, on thinking and behavior; the role of religion in the formation of identity; religion as a source of legitimacy, including political legitimacy; and religion as a formal institution with the ability to influence the political processes). All these aspects are consistently disclosed and analyzed through the chapters of the book.

The themes of Orthodoxy, liberalism and totalitarianism in modern Romania are unfolded through a series of historical events (political, economic and socio-cultural) of the last two centuries. The texts, combined in the monograph, are logically united and subordinated to the main idea (to represent the wide context of the religious life of Romania, inscribed in the canvas of historical events). Ten chapters of the book are devoted to the following aspects: religion in modern public life of Romania, monasticism in modern Romania; the problems of the organization of the Romanian Church during the years of the communist regime, the Church's attitude to 'right totalitarianism', and forms of resistance to the communist system on the part of the Church². Historical materials devoted to Dora d'Istria³ and

¹ Fox J., Sandler S. *Bringing Religion into International Relations. Culture and Religion in International Relations*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004. P. 2.

² Enache explains the logic, by which the chapters were arranged – see *Orthodoxy, liberalism and totalitarianism...* P. 11.

³ Duchess Helena Koltsova-Massalskaya, born Elena Ghica (1828-1888) – Romanian writer and artist (lived in Romania, Russia and Italy in different periods of her life and studies). Pen-name Dora d'Istria. Works: «La vie

Bishop Vartolomeu Stănescu¹ are curious as well as a section on religion in the context of Romanian folklore.

The methodological toolkit presented in the studies implies a synthetic set that includes the methods of a number of humanitarian disciplines due to the breadth and diversity of the texts arranged in the volume.

The subjects of the book as a whole give a comprehensive approach to the question of the place of religion in social and political life, casting light on the historical aspects of the problem, and setting a vector for modern analysis. For the Russian reader, the book seems valuable because by the example of Romania it is possible to draw parallels with similar processes that have taken place not so long ago in Russia (which allows us to interpret our own history more carefully).

As for the publication itself, there should be mentioned several points of critique. The volume freely combines two languages – English and French (depending on the topic of the chapter), which requires the reader's proficiency in both and make it rather stressful to switch between the languages. Full English or French text or bilingual version would be more convenient for the reader and would expand the general readership.

Navigating through the book is convenient, detailed references and the name index in the end allow even an unprepared reader to delve into the subject. The volume will be of interest for students of religion, scholars of philosophy and sociology of religion, political scientists and specialists in social relations.

Daria Chentsova

monastique dans l'Eglise orientale», «Les femmes en Orient», «Les roumains et la papauté», etc.

¹ Vartolomeu Stănescu (1875-1954) – Romanian Orthodox priest. Served as Bishop of the Lower Danube Eparchy (1912) in Argeș (1919-1920); Bishop of Râmnic (1921-1938). Studied sociology and law at the Sorbonne, wrote on topics of Christianity and socialism. Works: «Short trials of social Christianity», «The woman as a social factor», etc.